CLEARFIELD CITY COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES
7:00 P.M. WORK SESSION
October 9, 2012

PRESIDING: Don Wood Mayor

PRESENT: Kent Bush Councilmember
         Kathryn Murray Councilmember
         Mike LeBaron Councilmember
         Mark Shepherd Councilmember
         Bruce Young Councilmember

STAFF PRESENT: Brian Brower City Attorney
                Greg Krusi Police Chief
                Mike Stenquist Assistant Police Chief
                Wendy Brimhall Dispatch Supervisor
                Sean Montierth IT Manager
                Bob Wylie Administrative Services Director
                Nancy Dean City Recorder
                Kim Read Deputy City Recorder

EXCUSED: Adam Lenhard City Manager
         JJ Allen Assistant City Manager

VISITORS: There were no visitors.

Mayor Wood called the meeting to order at 7:27 p.m.

DISCUSSION ON DISPATCH SERVICES

The City Council toured the City’s Dispatch Center at 7:30 p.m.

The City Council returned to the Executive Conference Room at 8:00 p.m.

Bob Wylie, Administrative Services Director, distributed a handout reflecting the shared costs associated with funding the City’s dispatch center and reviewed it with the Council. He pointed out the dispatch center was supported by the general fund. He stated the variable cost was the actual operational budget and indicated most of that was for salaries. He reported the UCAN charge was for the State’s 800 mega hertz radio system. He stated the City did receive 911 revenue and directed the Council to that figure.

Mr. Wylie pointed out the City provided dispatch services for the City’s police department as well as North Davis Fire District (NDFD). He summarized the net cost for the dispatch center was approximately $530,000 per year.
Mayor Wood believed there were some other costs not represented in Mr. Wylie’s figures such as utilities, building space, etc. Mr. Wylie responded there were direct costs associated with dispatch and reported on those such as software specific to the EMS/Fire and reviewed those with the Council. Mr. Wylie then distributed a second handout which reflected the direct cost for providing dispatch services for NDFD. He pointed out there was approximately $15,000 directly related to NDFD dispatch services.

Councilmember Murray informed the Council that the NDFD had solicited a Request for Proposal (RFP) for dispatch services and reported Chief Bodily believed Davis County could provide dispatch services for approximately one third of the City’s costs. She inquired about the possible consequences to the City if the NDFD contracted with the County for its dispatch services.

Mr. Wylie responded the City had outright purchased the software required for fire dispatch services; therefore, nothing would be recovered from the purchase, but the City would no longer continue paying the annual maintenance costs. Mayor Wood inquired if the software purchase had been a request from the NDFD. Wendy Brimhall, Dispatch Supervisor, responded the purchase was a result of discussions with the administration of the NDFD. Mayor Wood clarified the purchase for the paging system wouldn’t have taken place without the request from Chief Bodily and Deputy Chief Beacraft. Councilmember Murray inquired if Davis County currently had software offering the same capabilities. Ms. Brimhall believed the County had the same capabilities. Sean Montierth, IT Manager, reported the County currently didn’t have the Centrix upgrade. He continued Clearfield’s dispatch center was the only one in Davis County that had purchased that upgrade to date. He indicated the County would eventually have it, but was not scheduled to receive it in the near future.

Councilmember Murray clarified even if the County were selected to provide dispatch services for the NDFD and a call was received in the City’s dispatch center, the call would be handled through Clearfield’s dispatch center. Ms. Brimhall emphasized the only difference would be the City’s dispatcher wouldn’t generate an incident report and wouldn’t be monitoring the call. Mayor Wood pointed out the City would not recognize any savings if the County were selected to provide dispatch services to NDFD because the center would still have to be manned and any calls received in the center would be addressed prior to it being received by the County. A discussion related to how dispatch service centers were funded specific to Clearfield residents took place.

Mayor Wood clarified the City would still have the fixed costs associated with the dispatch center, yet still provide dispatch services even if NDFD contracted with the County. Councilmember LeBaron inquired if another entity could benefit from the upgrades implemented at the City’s dispatch center. A discussion took place regarding possibly bringing in other entities to the City’s dispatch services center. Mayor Wood believed the County could provide the
services cheaper because their costs were shared by every taxpayer within the County. He expressed concern regarding the level of service received by residents when numerous calls were coming into a dispatch center.

Mayor Wood also expressed his opinion that upon the creation of the NDFD there was no intent or thought given to the fact NDFD would leave the City’s dispatch center and go to the County for those services. Brian Brower, City Attorney, distributed a page of the Resolution approving the creation of the NDFD and read from Section 3. He expressed his opinion there wasn’t any language which prohibited the NDFD from going elsewhere for dispatch services. He suggested the City might have looked on the creation of the District differently if it had entertained the idea that at some future time the District would take its dispatch services elsewhere creating a loss in annual revenue for the City. Mayor Wood pointed out the negotiations relative to the creation of the NDFD had taken place prior to his being elected to the City Council.

Councilmember LeBaron expressed his opinion the reason the NDFD was looking to the County to provide dispatch services at a lower fee was related to the property tax cap. Mr. Brower reported the District had appealed the property tax cap with the State Tax Commission and a decision was rendered to allow the District to raise its rate based on maintaining the same revenue or the certified tax rate. He noted the decision was based on an exception allowed in the State Code. Councilmember Shepherd commented the NDFD proposed tax rate would need to be approved by the City Council. Nancy Dean, City Recorder, added it would be before the Council for approval on Tuesday, October 23, 2012.

Councilmember Murray expressed her opinion it was the original intent for the City to provide the District with 911 dispatch services. Councilmember Shepherd also believed the intent of the original agreement was for the City to provide dispatch services; in addition the intent of the tax rate was not to cost them in the future but to maintain.

Mayor Wood advised members of the Council that as each one of them sat on various boards they should remember to represent the residents and community’s interest first and foremost. Councilmember Young agreed. He added that was why members of the Council sat on the boards, to represent Clearfield’s best interests. Councilmember Shepherd agreed. He further commented that was the purpose behind requiring elected officials to serve on the board of directors of the various special service districts.

Mayor Wood commented the intent behind creating the NDFD was to find efficiencies. He expressed his opinion that there was no original intent for dispatch services to be handled by another agency other than Clearfield City. He predicted the County’s bid for the dispatch services would be lower than the services could be provided by the City because the cost for the service could be spread across the tax base of the entire County. Councilmember Young expressed his opinion that the City needed to be able to validate why the cost was higher for it to provide dispatch services. He suggested the City could support the cost by identifying the increased service levels provided by the City. Councilmember LeBaron commented it should be
pointed out that the City was currently the only entity in Davis County able to provide a particular software module for the NDFD. Councilmember Shepherd believed the dispatch services in conjunction with the creation of the NDFD should be a focus point. Mayor Wood emphasized the fact that the City had been willing to make expenditures in the past which benefitted the NDFD and supported the City’s intent to provide the best possible dispatch services to the District and believed it should commit the same. He noted the expenditures made benefitted both residents of Clearfield and residents of West Point.

Mr. Brower pointed out the County was in a position to price the service at a lower cost per call rate because it had a larger tax base to fund the service making it impossible for the City to compete in providing the services for the District. He pointed out the cost to operate the City’s dispatch center would increase for its property owners if the City were to lose the NDFD revenue. He continued not only would the City’s property owners bear the burden of operating the dispatch center with less revenue, but they would also be paying additional funds to the County to provide dispatch services for the District.

Councilmember Shepherd stated the NDFD needed to focus on growth as a District. He continued the type of service the District provided could not be “sold,” just as the City could not compete with the County on a dollar by dollar basis. He expressed his opinion that the District could provide better service at a lower cost than the individual cities could provide by themselves. Councilmember Young asked if a comparison study had ever been completed to compare levels of service between the County’s and the City’s dispatch centers. He suggested the time needed to respond to calls for service should be a major component. Councilmember LeBaron suggested the qualified statistics would be included in the RFP (Request for Proposal). Councilmember Shepherd stated the District’s RFP had not asked for that particular statistic. Councilmember Young expressed his opinion that the knowledge of the geographical area of the City should also be considered as a competing factor.

Mayor Wood reminded the Council how much the City had contributed to the creation of the NDFD in the form of fire engines, ambulances, equipment and other things. He believed the contributions illustrated a significant commitment to the NDFD and stated the City should expect the same from the NDFD. He suggested the West Point City board members would feel the same way if their community had given so much to benefit the District. Mr. Brower pointed out the County could bid any amount to provide dispatch services for the District because it wouldn’t cost them any more to provide that service based on the low number of calls that would be received for the District. He continued it would simply mean more revenue for the County without incurring additional costs.

Councilmember Young stated Clearfield calls for emergency service would initially come through the Clearfield dispatch center no matter which entity was awarded the contract. He asked if there were any way to allow the District to pay the County for West Point calls while requiring
it to pay Clearfield for its calls thereby providing a way for Clearfield residents to be handled in their entirety through the City’s dispatch center. Mr. Brower believed that would be very difficult to accomplish. He acknowledged the NDFD only had legal authority to act in any capacity as delegated from the Clearfield City Council as the governing body. Councilmember Murray illustrated that point by reminding the Council that a few years ago the NDFD had voted to raise the certified tax rate, but when it came before the City Council for approval, the Council determined to keep the tax rate as proposed by the County rather than raising it. Mr. Brower explained that was because the District didn’t have the authority to levy a tax increase because of how it was established. He noted the Clearfield City Council was the governing body for the District.

Councilmember Shepherd believed the dispatch issue was entirely budget driven. Mayor Wood expressed appreciation to City staff for its efforts in providing information for the meeting.

The meeting adjourned at 8:45 p.m.

APPROVED AND ADOPTED
This 13th day of November, 2012
/s/Don Wood, Mayor

ATTEST:

/s/Nancy R. Dean, City Recorder

I hereby certify that the foregoing represents a true, accurate, and complete record of the Clearfield City Council meeting held Tuesday, October 9, 2012.

/s/Nancy R. Dean, City Recorder