

1 **CLEARFIELD PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING**

2 July 10, 2019

3 6:30 P.M. – Work Session

4
5 PRESIDING: Brady Jugler Chair

6
7 PRESENT: Brady Jugler Chair
8 Robert Browning Commissioner
9 Chris Uccardi Commissioner
10 David Bloomfield Alternate Commissioner
11 Ruth Jones Commissioner
12 Kathryn Murray Commissioner
13 Jacob Marston Alternate Commissioner
14 Eden Bush Youth Ambassador

15
16 STAFF PRESENT: Brie Brass Assistant City Attorney
17 Spencer Brimley Community Development Director
18 Brad McIlrath Senior Planner
19 Denise Clayburn Customer Service Rep
20

21 Commissioner Juglar called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

22
23 DISCUSSION ON FSP 1906-0001, A FINAL SUBDIVISION PLAT REQUEST FOR THE
24 MODA CLEARFIELD TOWNHOMES, A 41-UNIT TOWNHOME SUBDIVISION AT THE
25 SUBJECT PROPERTY. LOCATION: 180 S. STATE STREET (TIN: 12-001-0132). PARCEL
26 AREA: 1.79 ACRES. ZONE: T-R (TOWN RESIDENTIAL). PLANNER: BRAD MCILRATH
27 (ADMINISTRATIVE ACTION).

- 28
29 • Preliminary Subdivision Plat and Site Plan were previously approved.
30 • Final Subdivision Plat moving forward for development.
31 • They would be private units
32 • ADA requirements needed to be met with apartments not townhomes.
33 • ADA parking requirement would need to be met.
34

35 DISCUSSION ON SP 1906-0002, A SITE PLAN REQUEST BY SPENCER BARBER WITH
36 SUNRISE CONSTRUCTION FOR THE MAYFLY RISE TOWNHOMES, A 50-UNIT
37 TOWNHOME DEVELOPMENT AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTIES. LOCATION: 172 & 140
38 N. MAIN STREET (TIN: 12-001-0212, 12-010-0213, & 12-001-0002). PARCEL AREA:
39 1.918ACRES. ZONE: T-R (TOWN RESIDENTIAL).
40

- 41 • Originally a 50-unit townhomes site plan.
42 • Condition 3 setback should be 15 feet or an alley would be needed.
43 • Driveway would go right to the garage.

- Building 1 should line up with building 10.
- Changed from 50 units to 47 units.
- Traffic from Mayfly Rise would be limited to one access point off Main Street.

DISCUSSION ON PSP 1906-0003, A PRELIMINARY SUBDIVISION PLAT REQUEST FOR THE MAYFLY RISE TOWNHOMES, A 50-UNIT TOWNHOME SUBDIVISION AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTY. LOCATION: 172 & 140 N. MAIN STREET (TIN: 12-001-0212, 12-010-0213, & 12-001-0002). PARCEL AREA: 1.918 ACRES. ZONE: T-R (TOWN RESIDENTIAL).

- Preliminary subdivision plat for Mayfly Rise designated common areas.
- The townhomes would have an Home Owners Association (HOA).

DISCUSSION ON CUP 1906-0004, A CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT REQUEST BY UTILITY TRAILER FOR OUTDOOR STORAGE OF TRAILERS AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTY. LOCATION: APPROXIMATELY 1050 SOUTH 1000 WEST (TIN: 12-931-0001). PARCEL AREA: 17.61 ACRES. ZONE: M-1 (MANUFACTURING). PLANNER: BRAD MCILRATH (ADMINISTRATIVE)

- Relocation of the outdoor trailer storage.
- Street improvements needed on 1000 West.
- Chain link fence adjacent to property line.
- Could not have a see through fence.

The meeting adjourned at 7:00 p.m.

1 **CLEARFIELD PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING**

2 July 10, 2019

3 7:00 P.M. - Regular Session

4
5 **PRESIDING:** Brady Jugler Chair

6
7 **PRESENT:** Kathryn Murray Vice Chair
8 Robert Browning Commissioner
9 Ruth Jones Commissioner
10 Jacoby Marston Alternate Commissioner
11 Brett McAllister Commissioner
12 Chris Uccardi Commissioner
13 Nicole Bigelow Commissioner
14 David Bloomfield Alternate Commissioner
15 Eden Bush Youth Ambassador

16
17 **ABSENT:**

18
19 **STAFF PRESENT:** Brie Brass Assistant City Attorney
20 Spencer Brimley Community Development Director
21 Brad McIlrath Senior Planner
22 Denise, Clayburn Customer Service Rep

23
24 **VISITORS:** Betty Parker, LaRoy Shepherd, Mike Egbert, Spencer Barber, Julie
25 Johnson, James Bates, Jacob Briggs, Mitch Vance, Misty Stoker, Christian
26 Charrin, Steven Wilcox

27
28
29 The Pledge of Allegiance was led by Chair Jugler

30
31 **APPROVAL OF PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES**

32
33 None

34
35 Chair Jugler read the Planning Commission Chair statement.

36
37 Non-Public Hearing

38
39 **DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL OF FSP 1906-0001, A FINAL SUBDIVISION PLAT**
40 **REQUEST FOR THE MODA CLEARFIELD TOWNHOMES, A 41-UNIT**
41 **TOWNHOME SUBDIVISION AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTY. LOCATION: 180 S.**
42 **STATE STREET (TIN: 12-001-0132). PARCEL AREA: 1.79 ACRES. ZONE: T-R**
43 **(TOWN RESIDENTIAL). PLANNER: BRAD MCILRATH(ADMINISTRATIVE**
44 **ACTION).**

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45

Brad McIlrath presented the following facts:

- Approved by Planning Commission in September 2018.
- Final plat request for MODA Townhouse.
- Code state the need to have a seven foot side walk.

Staff recommended approval with the conditions that were reviewed.

Questions from the Planning Commission:

- None

Mitch Vance presented the following points of discussion:

- No potential tenants have been identified yet.
- Will keep as rentals for now.

Commissioner Uccardi moved to approve as conditioned FSP 1906-0001, a final subdivision plat request for the MODA Clearfield Townhomes, a 41-unit townhome subdivision at the subject property. Location: 180 S. State Street (TIN: 12-001-0132). Parcel Area: 1.79 Acres. Zone: T-R (Town Residential). The recommendation was based on the findings and discussions in the Staff Report with the following conditions:

- 1) **Plans shall be revised to address Clearfield City Engineering requirements prior to obtaining final signatures on the plat and recording of that plat.**
- 2) **The applicant shall record the CC&R's for the homeowner's association with the final subdivision plat.**
- 3) **The developer shall install of the public right of way improvements required by the Downtown Clearfield Form-Based Code for the frontages along 200 South and State Street.**
- 4) **The final subdivision plat shall dedicate all sidewalk and park strip improvements as part of the public right of ways for 200 South and State Street. All sidewalks required as part of the street improvements shall be located within a public right of way.**
- 5) **The subdivision civil and improvement drawings shall be revised to match the final approved site plan drawings once that approval is granted. This includes all streetscape designs, private amenities, landscaping plans, etc.**
- 6) **The applicant is responsible for the replacement or repair of deteriorated, damaged or missing surface improvements surrounding the perimeter of the subdivision. This includes, but is not limited to: curb and gutter, sidewalks, landscaping park strip improvements, driveways, etc.**
- 7) **An escrow or bond agreement for the public improvements will be subject to approval by the City Engineer and City Attorney and be established prior to any permits being issued for the property or plat being recorded. The financial security shall be established prior to recordation of the Final Plat as outlined in Section 12-4-6 of the Subdivision Ordinance.**

1 **Seconded by Commissioner Murray. The motion carried on the following vote: Voting**
2 **AYE: Commissioners Browning, Murray, Jones, Bigelow, McAllister and Uccardi. Voting**
3 **NO: None.**
4
5

6 DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL OF SP 1906-0002, A SITE PLAN REQUEST BY SPENCER
7 BARBER WITH SUNRISE CONSTRUCTION FOR THE MAYFLY RISE TOWNHOMES, A
8 50-UNIT TOWNHOME DEVELOPMENT AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTIES. LOCATION:
9 172 & 140 N. MAIN STREET (TIN: 12-001-0212, 12-010-0213, & 12-001-0002). PARCEL
10 AREA: 1.918ACRES. ZONE: T-R (TOWN RESIDENTIAL).
11

12 Brad McIlrath presented the following facts:
13

- 14 • Located at Radon be Gone, location.
- 15 • 1.918 Acres.
- 16 • Zoned T-R.
- 17 • Purposed site plan was presented.
- 18 • 7 foot furnishing zone along State Street.
- 19 • 10 buildings, buildings 1-2 six units, buildings 7 and 10 will have six units, buildings 3-4
20 and 8-9 will have four units, and buildings 5-6 will have 5 units.
- 21 • They will have an open space and landscape plan.-?
- 22 • They will need to have a sprinkler system because fire truck would not fit in the ally way.
- 23 • Code required the building structure to be 15% windows per elevation.
- 24 • Buildings 1-2 will have 2 car garage on first floor. Second floor will be the main living
25 area. Third floor will have 3 bedrooms.
- 26 • Buildings 3 and 4 will have a 2 car garage main floor. Second floor will be main living
27 area. Third floor will have 3 bedrooms.
- 28 • Buildings 5 and 6 similar plans but the stair layout is a little different. There will be a two
29 car garage on the main floor, second floor will be the main living area, third floor will
30 have 3 bedrooms.
- 31 • Buildings 8 and 9 will have a 2 car garage on the main floor. Second floor will have the
32 main living. Third floor will have 2 bedrooms.
- 33 • Buildings 7 and 10 first floor will have a 2 car garage. Second floor will have the main
34 living area. Third floor will have 2 to 3 bedrooms.

35
36 Staff recommended approval with the conditions that were reviewed.
37

38 Questions from the Planning Commission:
39

- 40 • Commissioner McAllister had question about how this would affect the neighborhood to
41 the north. Because it is a town house rather than a muti-family or mixed use building
42 there is not any standards that apply to mitigate the impact of the buildings.

- 1 • Commissioner Jones had questions on Condition #6 front porches will it be enforced on
2 all of the buildings? Mr. McIlrath responded that yes it will be enforced on all the
3 building.
4

5 Jacob Briggs Manager of Sunrise Construction presented the following points of discussion:

- 6 • Mr. Briggs complemented the staff.
7 • Sunrise Construction is excited to work with Clearfield City.
8 • Sunrise Construction will be trying to apply more 3 bedroom townhouses.
9 • Mayfly Rise Townhouse's will be a high quality townhouse complex.
10 • On building #1 the 10 foot setback was an oversight on their part.
11 • They will be eliminating one of the 4 unit buildings to meet the 10 foot setback and to add
12 more open space.
13 • Condition # 4 their engineers recommended to not use any semi pervious materials.
14 • Semi pervious materials are less likely to last in Utah Weather.
15 • Semi pervious materials are not required.-?
16 • There was a discussion about the semi-pervious and pervious materials.
17 • The sidewalk should be a least 7 feet wide along Main Street.
18 • Mayfly Rise wanted to have the HOA pick the playground equipment in the pocket park.
19 • Spencer Barber explained the external material's that they were planning to use.
20 • The Commission member's discussed what kind of building materials should be used.
21

22 Steven Wilcox Clearfield City Resident protested the project and had several concerns regarding
23 the project. His concerns were the following:
24

- 25 • Easement for the water laterals will be very dangerous.
26 • The water lines will have to be relocated.
27 • The burden for the relocation will be on the resident not the developers.
28 • The property will become a virtual tunnel.
29 • There will be light pollution.
30 • Property value will go down for the single family homes.
31 • Widows and widowers will be affected.
32 • There will be sun rot. The temperature will be at least 120 degrees between the buildings.
33 • The sun light will cause the single family home to have to be repainted every 2 years.
34 • The townhomes will cause the temperature for the single family homes to go up.
35

36 **Commissioner Jones moved to approve as conditioned SP 1906-0002, a site plan request by**
37 **Spencer Barber with Sunrise Construction for the Mayfly Rise Townhomes, a 50-unit**
38 **townhome development at the subject properties. Location: 172 & 140 N. Main Street (TIN:**
39 **12-001-0212, 12-010-0213, & 12-001-0002). Parcel Area: 1.918Acres. Zone: T-R (Town**
40 **Residential).**

41 **01) The subdivision for this development shall be approved and recorded prior to the issuance**
42 **of any building permit.**

- 1 02) Building #1 shall have a minimum build to zone of ten feet (10') along the Main Street
2 frontage as required by code.
- 3 03) Buildings #4 & #5 shall have a minimum rear yard setback of fifteen feet (15') from the rear
4 (east) property line.
- 5 04) Additional information shall be provided to indicate the maximum impervious coverage
6 and the semi-pervious coverage of the development. The development shall comply with the
7 maximum
8 impervious coverage of 65% and semi-pervious coverage of 20%.
- 9 05) The building windows shall be revised to meet the minimum 15% transparency per floor.
- 10 06) The townhomes shall be revised to have a stoop or porch entrance that is two and a half feet
11 (2.5') above grade as required by code.
- 12 07) The parapet shall be revised to provide a horizontal expression line at the bottom of the
13 parapet
14 as required by code.
- 15 08) The plans shall be revised to indicate the secondary building materials that are used. The
16 secondary materials shall comply with the approved materials outlined in code.
- 17 09) The residential windows shall be revised to meet the window standards of the code.
- 18 10) The plans shall be revised to indicate that commercial quality doors, windows, and
19 hardware will be used for the project.
- 20 11) The Pocket Park open space type shall be revised to include the following modifications:
21 a. A final playground design for the park shall be included with the revised plans;
22 b. Benches shall be added around the playground for the use of patrons and residents of
23 the development;
24 c. The pocket park must have a minimum area of 0.10 acre (4,356 square feet) to comply
25 with code. This does not include the common paseo that is located in front of buildings
26 #8 & #9.
- 27 12) The site and landscape plans shall be revised to include the following standards:
28 a. The sidewalk and furnishing zones along Main Street shall be a minimum of seven feet
29 (7') wide each;
30 b. The furnishing zone along the Main Street frontage shall be provided with Honey Locust
31 street trees spaced twenty (20) to forty (40) apart on center and planted within 5'x5'
32 tree grates. The tree grates are to be the approved material and design provided by
33 Clearfield City;
34 c. The site shall be provided with an additional seventeen (17) trees to comply with the
35 minimum 20 trees per 1 acre standard;
36 d. A minimum landscape planting strip of four feet (4') shall be provided around each
37 building as required by code, except in areas needed for access;
38 e. The plans shall be revised to provide parking lot islands that comply with the minimum
39 width and planting standards of the code (See page 9 of this report);
40 f. The plans shall be revised to provide a minimum five foot (5') buffer between the
41 sidewalk and the property line with a six foot (6') tall fence as required by code. The
42 buffer shall comply with all standards for buffers as outlined on page 61 of the code.
- 43 13) Benches shall be provided and shown on the plans no greater than 200 feet apart and placed
44 at the back of the sidewalk or within the furnishing zone and facing the street. The benches
45 shall be a decorative street bench approved by Clearfield City.
- 46 14) The plans shall be revised to provide the double acorn street lights along Main Street. The
47 lights shall be located within the furnishing zone on each street and spaced between sixty
48 (60) to ninety (90) feet on center to match the existing distances within the downtown area.

- 1 15) The plans shall be revised to provide an ADA van accessible parking space for the
2 development.
3 16) The plans shall be revised to provide a minimum of twelve (12) bicycle parking spaces. The
4 design of the bicycle parking shall comply with the standards outlined on page 69 of the
5 code.
6 17) The plans shall be revised to provide a snow stacking area that meets the standards outlined
7 in Section 11-13-5 G of the Clearfield Municipal Code.
8 18) The project shall comply with all North Davis Sewer District standards.
9 19) The project shall comply with all North Davis Fire District standards as outlined in the
10 attached review letter and as otherwise required.
11 20) The project shall comply with all City Engineer standards as outlined in the review
12 transmittal and as otherwise required.

13 **Seconded by Commissioner Murray. The motion carried on the following vote: Voting**
14 **AYE: Commissioners Browning, Murray, Jones, Bigelow, McAllister and Uccardi. Voting**
15 **NO: None.**
16
17

18 DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL OF PSP 1906-0003, A PRELIMINARY
19 SUBDIVISION PLAT REQUEST FOR THE MAYFLY RISE TOWNHOMES, A 50-
20 UNIT TOWNHOME SUBDIVISION AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTY. LOCATION:
21 172 & 140 N. MAIN STREET(TIN: 12-001-0212, 12-010-0213, & 12-001-0002).
22 PARCEL AREA: 1.918 ACRES. ZONE: T-R (TOWN RESIDENTIAL).
23

24 Brad McIlrath presented the following facts:
25

- 26 • Site plan has been approved subject to the conditions being met. All condition need to be
27 met before the final subdivision plat can be approved.
28 • 50 units will likely be reduced to 49 or 48.
29 • Utility plan for the new units was revised.
30 • Irrigation line would be relocated to accommodate existing users.
31

32 Questions from the Planning Commission:
33

- 34 • Commissioner Murray asked if the three properties would be made into one.
35 • Commissioner Browning asked would it be updated with the new number of units.
36 • Commissioner McAllister asked what units would be removed and what space will be
37 opened up.
38 • Commissioner Murray asked if the open space would be in one or more places.
39 • Chair Jugler asked if this will have to be revisited.
40

41 Mr. McIlrath responded:
42

- 43 • The changes will be substantial but they will not change the overall plan, so they will not
44 need to be revisited.

1
2 **Commissioner Jones moved to approve as conditioned on PSP 1906-0003, a preliminary**
3 **subdivision plat request for the Mayfly Rise Townhomes, a 50-unit townhome subdivision**
4 **at the subject property. Location: 172 & 140 N. Main Street(TIN: 12-001-0212, 12-010-**
5 **0213, & 12-001-0002). Parcel Area: 1.918 Acres. Zone: T-R (Town Residential)**

- 6 1) **The subdivision plans shall be revised to address Clearfield City Engineering requirements**
7 **prior to the submittal of plans for Final Plat review and approval.**
- 8 2) **The subdivision plat shall be revised to indicate the private lots, the common areas, and any**
9 **limited common areas of the subdivision.**
- 10 3) **A full civil set of plans shall be submitted as part of the final subdivision plat review which**
11 **shall include but not be limited to: site plan, grading and drainage plan, utility plan, storm**
12 **water pollution prevention plan (SWPPP), roadway cross sections, etc.**
- 13 4) **The project shall include the creation of a Homeowners Association (HOA) to maintain all of**
14 **the private common spaces of the project, including but not limited to: landscaping, snow**
15 **removal, building maintenance, trash collection, and open space areas.**
- 16 5) **A copy of the HOA establishing documents shall be provided as part of the final subdivision**
17 **plat submittal and shall comply with ordinance standards outlined in Section 11-13-24 of the**
18 **Clearfield Municipal Code.**
- 19 6) **The applicant shall submit a geotechnical report as part of the final subdivision plat**
20 **application.**
- 21 7) **The applicant is responsible for the replacement or repair of deteriorated, damaged or**
22 **missing surface improvements surrounding the perimeter of the subdivision. This includes,**
23 **but is not limited to: curb and gutter, sidewalks, landscaping park strip improvements,**
24 **driveways, etc.**
- 25 8) **An escrow or bond agreement as required by Section 12-9-2 of the Subdivision Ordinance**
26 **shall be provided and will be subject to approval by the City Engineer and City Attorney.**
27 **The agreement for the public improvements shall be established prior to obtaining any**
28 **permits for the properties or plat being recorded.**

29 **Seconded by Commissioner Uccardi. The motion carried on the following vote: Voting**
30 **AYE: Commissioners Browning, Murray, Jones, Bigelow, McAllister and Uccardi. Voting**
31 **NO: None.**

32
33
34 DISCUSSION AND APPROVAL OF CUP 1906-0004, A CONDITIONAL USE
35 PERMIT REQUEST BY UTILITY TRAILER FOR OUTDOOR STORAGE OF
36 TRAILERS AT THE SUBJECT PROPERTY. LOCATION: APPROXIMATELY 1050
37 SOUTH 1000 WEST (TIN: 12-931-0001). PARCEL AREA: 17.61 ACRES. ZONE: M-1
38 (MANUFACTURING). PLANNER: BRAD MCILRATH (ADMINISTRATIVE)
39

40 Brad McIlrath presented the following facts:

- 41
- 42 • New storage area for Utility trailer.
- 43 • Lifetime Products will be expanding in location of current storage area.
- 44 • Compacted road base used for the parking surface.
- 45 • Site plan will include curb, gutter and sidewalk improvements on 1000 west.

- 1 • There will be a berm with 6' fencing on top for screening.
- 2 • Chain link fence cannot run along 1000 west.
- 3 • Modified landscape plan was reviewed.
- 4 • Landscaping and irrigation shall be revised to meet the minimum code requirements.
- 5 • Outside storage needs to be impervious to sight. It cannot be screened with a chain link
- 6 fence.

7

8 Questions from the Planning Commission:

9

- 10 • Chair Jugler had a question regarding the height of the fence and the trailers.

11

12 Mr. McIlarth responded:

13

- 14 • M1 zone needs to have 10 o/o of landscaping.
- 15 • State code does not allow the use of hardship.
- 16 • Betty Parker would like to use the non-confirming use.
- 17 • Non-confirming does not apply in this case.
- 18 • Freeport will be adding the trees under protest.
- 19 • The martial needs to be impervious.

20

21 Betty Parker property manager from Freeport Center:

22

- 23 • Thanked the Planning Commission for their services
- 24 • Freeport has been doing the same thing for 56 years.
- 25 • Get rid of the trees along 1000 west
- 26 • Commissioner McAllister asked about the curb and gutter along 1000 west.
- 27 • Commissioner Browning asked about if the access to the property be provided.
- 28 • LaRoy Sheppard from Utility Trailer discussed the access to Utility Trailer.
- 29 • Commissioner Uccardi was very happy that the curb and gutter is going in.

30

31 **Commissioner Uccardi moved to approve as conditioned on CUP 1906-0004, a conditional**

32 **use permit request by Utility Trailer for outdoor storage of trailers at the subject property.**

33 **Location: Approximately 1050 South 1000 West (TIN: 12-931-0001). Parcel Area: 17.61**

34 **Acres. Zone: M-1 (Manufacturing).**

35

36

37

38

39

40

41

42

43

- 1) The project shall comply with all applicable development standards of the M-1 Zone.
- 2) The landscaping and irrigation plans shall be revised to meet the minimum code requirements which include:
 - a. An additional eighty one (81) trees shall be provided; and
 - b. An additional 57,371.16 square feet of landscaping shall be provided to comply with the minimum ten percent (10%) required for the M-1 Zone.
- 3) The site fencing shall have a minimum height of six feet (6') and shall be constructed of a material that is impervious as required by code.
- 4) The project shall comply with engineering standards / requirements and obtain approval prior to the issuance of final Land Use approval.

1 5) The applicant shall obtain a building permit for all site work prior to the commencement of
2 said work.

3 **Seconded by Commissioner Jones. The motion carried on the following vote: Voting AYE:**
4 **Commissioners Browning, Murray, Jones, Bigelow, McAllister and Uccardi. Voting NO:**
5 **None.**

6
7
8 STAFF COMMONICATION

- 9
10 • Payment for the first part of the year have been sent out.
11 • Joint work with City Council on July 30th at 6:00.

12
13
14 PLANNING COMMISSIONERS' MINUTE

15
16 Youth Ambassador Bush – Nothing

17
18 Commissioner McAllister – Great firework show on the 4th of July.

19
20 Commissioner Uccardi – Appreciate that the public are here. We do have to follow the law.

21
22 Commissioner Murray – Nothing

23
24 Commissioner Browning – Nothing

25
26 Commissioner Jones – 4th of July was great. Planning commission should have a float in the 4th
27 July parade

28
29 Commissioner Marston – Last day as commissioner. Wanted to thank Clearfield for all he has
30 learned.

31
32 Commissioner Bigelow – Nothing

33
34 Chair Jugler – The commissioner are bond by the law. Thanked Commissioner Marston.

35
36 There being no further business to come before the Planning Commission, **Commissioner**
37 **Uccardi moved to adjourn at 9:25 P.M. Seconded by Commissioner Jones.**