MEETING AGENDA OF THE CLEARFIELD CITY PLANNING COMMISSION

Notice is hereby given that the Clearfield City Planning Commission will hold a regularly scheduled meeting at 7:00 P.M., Wednesday, June 19th, 2019, on the 3rd floor in the City Council Chambers of the Clearfield City Municipal Building, located at 55 S. State Street, Clearfield, UT 84015.

WORK SESSION – 6:30 PM – Executive Conference Room
Review agenda items to address questions.

CALL TO ORDER - PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: April 3, 2019 Regular Meeting
April 17, 2019 Work Session and Regular Meeting
May 8, 2019 Work Session and Regular Meeting

PLANNING COMMISSION CHAIR STATEMENT

DECISION ITEMS

Non-Public Hearings
1. Discussion and Possible Action on CUP 1905-007, a conditional use permit request by Brad Carter with NovaSource Sunwest, LLC to construct a Valvoline Instant Oil Change center at the subject property. Location: 856 West Antelope Drive (TIN: 12-667-0024). Parcel Area: 0.41 Acres. Zone: C-2 (Commercial). Planner: Brad McIlrath (Administrative Matter).

DISCUSSION ITEMS
2. Staff Discussion
   a) Permitted Building Materials
   b) Accessory Building Materials (Chapter 11-13-38)
3. Planning Commissioners’ Minute
4. Staff Communications

**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING ADJOURNED**

Dated this 10th day of June, 2019
/s/ Brad McIlrath, Senior Planner

The City of Clearfield, in accordance with the ‘Americans with Disabilities Act’, provides accommodations and auxiliary communicative aids and services for all those citizens needing assistance. Persons requesting accommodations for City sponsored public meetings, service programs, or events, should call the Customer Service Center at 801-525-2701, giving the City a 48 hour notice.

The Work Session meeting is a public meeting; however, public comments are only received in the formal Planning Commission meeting. The Planning Commission Public Meeting is a public forum where the Planning Commission receives comment from applicants, the public, applicable agencies and County staff regarding land use applications and other items on the Commission’s agenda. In addition, it is where the Planning Commission takes action on these items. Action may be taken which may include: approval, approval with conditions, denial, continuance or recommendation to other bodies as applicable.
TO: Clearfield City Planning Commission

FROM: Brad McIlrath, Senior Planner
brad.mcilrath@clearfieldcity.org
(801) 525-2784

MEETING DATE: Wednesday, June 19th, 2019

SUBJECT: Discussion and Possible Action on CUP 1905-007, a conditional use permit request by Brad Carter with NovaSource Sunwest, LLC to construct a Valvoline Instant Oil Change center at the subject property. Location: 856 West Antelope Drive (TIN: 12-667-0024). Parcel Area: 0.41 Acres. Zone: C-2 (Commercial). Planner: Brad McIlrath (Administrative Matter).

RECOMMENDATION

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve as conditioned, CUP 1905-0007, a conditional use permit request by Brad Carter with NovaSource Sunwest, LLC to construct a Valvoline Instant Oil Change center at the property addressed 856 West Antelope Drive (TIN: 12-667-0024). This recommendation is based on the discussion and findings in the Staff Report.

PROJECT SUMMARY

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Project Information</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Project Name</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Site Location</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tax ID Number</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Applicant</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Owner</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Tod B &amp; Denise H Jones – Trustees (30%)</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Proposed Actions</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Current Zoning</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Land Use Classification</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gross Site</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BACKGROUND

Brad Carter with NovaSource Sunwest, LLC is seeking conditional use permit approval to construct a 3,360 square foot Valvoline Instant Oil Change center at this location. This center will include two drive-thru service bays, an underground pit area for the bays, and an office/lobby area. The site design includes sufficient distance for the motor vehicle stacking for each bay. The entrance of the bays is located on the north side of the building with multiple points of access by way of cross access easements.
**Site Access and Parking (Chapters 11-14 & 11-18)**

Chapter 11-14 “Off Street Parking and Loading” and 11-18 “Design Standards” outline the development standards for site access and parking for properties located in the C-2 Zone. Based upon the nature of this type of use, very little parking spaces are needed for customers. Clearfield City code does not include a parking standard for this type of use. Based upon standards identified by the American Planning Association in the Planning Advisory Service report 510 “Parking Standards” staff determines that the ten (10) parking spaces provided for this use is sufficient. The ADA parking space will need to be revised to include an eight foot (8’) wide access aisle to comply with federal standards.

As required by chapter 11-18, the site will need to be designed to provide a pedestrian access from the public sidewalk along Antelope Drive. As outlined in that chapter, this pedestrian access will need to be a minimum of five feet (5’) wide and be constructed of a different material than the parking lot as to be more identifiable. The proposed site plan includes a five foot (5’) wide pedestrian access to the sidewalk with striping for the walkway across the parking lot. The walkway across the parking lot will need to be constructed of a different material then the parking lot as listed above.

**Site Landscaping and Open Space (Sections 11-11B-12A, 11-13-23, 11-14-5F, & 11-18-4D)**

The C-2 Zone requires that a minimum of 10% of the total lot or parcel area be provided as landscaped open space. Based upon the submitted site plan, 4,992 square feet or 23% of the site is provided with landscaping. As required by Section 11-13-23, landscape areas must include one (1) tree for every 500 square feet and one (1) shrub for every 300 square feet of landscaped area. Based upon these standards the site is required to include ten (10) trees and seventeen (17) shrubs. The proposed landscape plan provides nine (9) trees and forty one (41) shrubs. The landscape plan will need to be revised to include one (1) additional tree. All trees and shrubs that are planted must meet the planting standards outlined in Section 11-13-23 of the Land Use Ordinance.

Section 11-14-5F outlines standards for parking lot landscaping. When single row of parking is provided, there must be at least one (1) island for every twelve (12) spaces and must include one deciduous tree. This site includes a landscape island on the east end of the property. This island will need to be provided with one (1) deciduous tree as required by code and must include additional shrubbery and ground cover. As required by this code section, parking areas that abut a front yard or road frontage landscape area are required to be screened with a landscape hedge not less than three feet (3’) in height. The plant materials in this area must be evergreen species, have a minimum size of five (5) gallons and spaced no farther than five feet (5’) apart on center. The hedge must be set back a minimum of three feet (3’) and a maximum of six feet (6’) from the perimeter of any parking space.

In accordance with landscaping standards outlined in Chapter 18 (Design Standards), “drought resistant shrubs and trees are encouraged wherever possible in conjunction with efficient low water use irrigation systems.” As a guide to determine if this landscape design is utilizing drought tolerant or resistant plants, staff recommends that the applicant refer to the list found at [www.waterwiseplants.utah.gov](http://www.waterwiseplants.utah.gov) and replace the proposed materials with those found on that list.

**Dumpster Enclosures (Sections 11-11B-12B & 11-18-4C 2)**

The proposed site plans shows a dumpster enclosure located at the north end of the property. To comply with ordinance standards, the enclosure shall be screened so the dumpsters cannot be seen by the public right-of-way. The enclosures must be constructed out of materials that match the building material or approved masonry enclosure.
Building Design and Materials (Chapters 11-11B & 18)

Chapters 11-11B “Commercial Zone C-2” and 18 “Design Standards,” outline all of the site and building design standards required for new development or major changes to a site within the City. As required by the C-2 Zone, the building must include brick, stucco, rock, or vinyl siding. Any building elevation facing a street right of way must have at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock. The proposed building materials include the use of a stone veneer along all elevations and predominantly along the front façade. The street elevation will need to be revised to include one additional material listed above. The building also includes the use of hardie plank lap siding and a metal awning over the front entrance. All of the materials that are proposed are of high quality and should be allowed. Staff recommends that the project be approved as proposed with the needed additions to the front elevation.

As required by chapter 18, the building provides articulation and treatment for the entrances to indicate the transition from the exterior to interior of the building. The development addresses pedestrian scaling, amenities, landscape design, and architecture features required by code. The architecture provides façade articulation, roofline, and vertical and horizontal variations which add to the visual appeal and design for this area.

PUBLIC COMMENT

A public notice was placed on the property on June 7th, 2019. No public comments have been received to date.

CITY DEPARTMENT / AGENCY REVIEW

The plans were sent to the North Davis Sewer District, North Davis Fire District, City Engineer, and related Public Works staff on May 31, 2019. Comments have been provided by the North Davis Fire District. The review letter from the North Davis Fire District is attached to this report. Comments from the Staff Engineer will be provided to the applicant upon receipt by the Senior Planner. Comments provided by these representatives are included as conditions of approval at the end of this report.

GENERAL STANDARDS

Conditional Use Permit Review

Clearfield Land Use Ordinance Section 11-4-3 establishes the general standards and determination the Planning Commission shall make to approve Conditional Use Permits. The findings and staff’s evaluation are outlined below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>General Standard</th>
<th>Staff Analysis</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>DETERMINATION: A Conditional Use Permit shall be approved if conditions are proposed, or can be imposed, to mitigate the reasonably anticipated detrimental effects of the proposed use in accordance with the standards set forth [in the Land Use Code]. If the reasonably anticipated detrimental impacts or effects of the proposed conditional use cannot be substantially mitigated or eliminated by the proposal or the imposition of conditions to achieve compliance with the standards set forth [in the Land Use Code], the Conditional Use Permit may be denied.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1) Equivalent to Permitted Use: Any detrimental impacts or effects from the proposed use on any of the following shall not exceed those which</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
could reasonably be expected to arise from a use that is permitted in the zone:

a. The health, safety, and welfare of the City and its present and future inhabitants and businesses;
b. The prosperity of the City and its present and future inhabitants and businesses;
c. The peace and good order, comfort, convenience and aesthetics of the City and its present and future inhabitants and businesses;
d. The tax base;
e. Economy in governmental expenditures;
f. The State’s agricultural and other industries;
g. The urban and nonurban development;
h. Access to sunlight for solar energy devices; or
i. Property values.

The applicant is responsible to address any detrimental impacts of the development. With conditions to address site design, landscaping, and circulation, the proposed use will be equivalent to a permitted use.

Impact Burden: Any cost of mitigating or eliminating detrimental impacts or effects in excess of those which could be reasonably expected to arise from a permitted use shall become a charge against the development so as not to constitute a burden on the municipality, surrounding neighbors, or adjacent land uses.

The development will be required to comply with ordinance standards as outlined in this report and associated agency/department review letters/comments. The burden to meet all the conditions will be on the applicant.

Conform to the Objectives of the General Plan: The proposed conditional use shall not limit the effectiveness of land use controls, imperil the success of the General Plan for the community, promote blight or injure property values.

The proposed use does not limit the effectiveness of land use controls or the success of the General Plan. With conditions, the proposed use is not anticipated to promote blight or injure property values, but will contribute to the area. Conditions of approval are proposed to mitigate impacts of the proposed use and promote property investment and improvement.

**CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL**

The following conditions of approval shall be addressed by the applicant and shown on a set of revised plans prior to issuance of final land use approval unless otherwise noted.

1) The project shall comply with all applicable development standards of the C-2 Zone.
2) A landscape and irrigation plan shall be submitted and must meet the minimum landscape standards of the C-2 Zone and Clearfield City which includes, but is not limited to the following:
   a. One additional deciduous tree shall be added to the landscape island at the east end of the front row of parking island. Shrubbery shall be added to the island as required by code.
   b. The front landscaping area between Antelope Drive and the parking area shall be modified to include a planting hedge to screen the parking area as required by ordinance.
3) The dumpster enclosure shall be constructed of the same material that matches the building or an approved masonry.
4) The access aisle for the ADA parking space shall be increased to eight feet (8’) wide to meet federal standards.
5) The pedestrian path across the parking lot shall be constructed of a separate material then the parking as required by ordinance.
6) The front building façade materials shall be revised to comply with the approved materials outlined in the C-2 zone.
7) The project shall comply with all applicable fire code standards and obtain North Davis Fire District approval prior to the issuance of final Land Use Approval.
8) The project shall comply with engineering standards / requirements and obtain approval prior to the issuance of final Land Use Approval.
9) The applicant shall obtain a building permit for all site work prior to the commencement of said work.
10) The applicant shall obtain a Clearfield City Business License prior to the commencement of business operations at this site.

**ATTACHMENTS**

1. Site Plan
2. Utility Plan
3. Grading & Drainage Plan
4. Erosion Control Plan
5. Architectural Site Plan
6. Landscape Plan
7. NDFD Review Letter dated 12 June 2019
MANUFACTURED STONE VENEER - CULTURED STONE COUNTRY Ledges - CHARDONNAY
HARDIE PLANK LAP SIDING - SMOOTH "AUTUMN TAN"

MBC STANDING METAL PANEL - 24 GA - BATEN LOK H5 SYSTEM - "VALVOLINE RED"
HARDIE PLANK TRIM - SMOOTH "ARCTIC WHITE"
TO: Brad McIlrath/ Clearfield City Planner
   Brad Carter / Applicant
   Ron Witzel / Contractor

FROM: John Taylor / Fire Marshal

RE: Valvoline Oil Change

DATE:     June 12, 2019
I have reviewed the site plan submitted for the above referenced project. The Fire Prevention Division of this Fire District has the following comments/concerns.

1. The minimum fire flow requirement is 1500 gallons per minute for 60 consecutive minutes for residential one and two family dwellings. Fire flow requirements may be increased for residential one and two family dwellings with a building footprint equal to or greater than 3,600 square feet or for buildings other than one and two family dwellings. Provide documentation that the fire flow has been confirmed through the Clearfield City water dept.

2. Application for plan review has not been received to our office, along with the corresponding fee. I sent Ron Witzel an application on June 3, 2019 and he responded that he had received it and would get it filled out, submitted and the fees paid.

These plans have been reviewed for Fire District requirements only. Other departments must review these plans and will have their requirements. This review by the Fire District must not be construed as final approval from Clearfield City.
TO: Clearfield City Planning Commission  
FROM: Brad McIlrath, Senior Planner  
MEETING DATE: Wednesday, June 19, 2019  
SUBJECT: Discussion on Multi-Family Residential and Commercial Building materials for new development in Clearfield City.

DESCRIPTION / BACKGROUND

The Clearfield City Land Use Ordinance (Title 11) establishes the zones of the City along with the development standards for buildings and uses in each zone. Due to recent concerns over the types of permitted building materials that are allowed for new development and those that are not allowed, staff provides this information for the discussion and consideration by the Planning Commission. This discussion does not include the standards for materials in the Form-Based Code area, as that discussion will be provided as part of the update at a later date. The purpose of this discussion is to identify the current permitted materials for non-FBC zones in the City and determine if code amendments are necessary to encourage high quality design and creativity for new development in Clearfield.

SPECIFIC BUILDING MATERIALS BY ZONE

The following sections provide a review of the required building materials for each zone.

Agricultural Zones (A-1 & A-2)

Exterior Building Materials:

1. Permitted exterior building materials for main buildings shall be brick, stucco, stone, rock, or vinyl siding.

2. Vinyl siding shall not be permitted on the front elevation of a main building. (Ord. 2009-24, 11-24-2009)

3. Reserved. (Ord. 2017-06, 4-25-2017)

4. The front elevation and any side elevation facing a street or right-of-way shall include at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock.
**Single-Family Residential Zones (R-1-9, R-1-8, R-1-6, R-1-Open)**

Exterior Building Materials:
1. Permitted exterior building materials for main buildings shall be brick, stucco, stone, rock, or vinyl siding.
2. Vinyl siding shall not be permitted on the front elevation of a main building. (Ord. 2009-26, 11-24-2009)
3. Detached garages and carports shall be finished to match the exterior of the main building. (Ord. 2017-06, 4-25-2017)
4. The front elevation and any side elevation facing a street or right-of-way shall include at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock.

**Multi-Family Residential Zones (R-2 & R-3)**

Exterior Building Materials:
1. Permitted exterior building materials for single-family and two-family dwelling units shall be brick, stucco, stone, rock, or vinyl siding. Vinyl siding shall not be a permitted exterior building material for multiple-family dwellings.
2. Vinyl siding shall not be permitted on the front elevation of a main building.
3. Accessory buildings shall be built with a finished, all weather exterior material. Detached garages and carports shall be finished to match the exterior of the main building.
4. Any building elevation facing a street or right of way shall include at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock.

**Commercial Zones (C-1 & C-2)**

Exterior Building Materials:
1. Permitted exterior building materials for main buildings shall be brick, stucco, stone, rock, or vinyl siding.
2. Vinyl siding shall not be permitted on the front elevation of a main building.
3. Accessory buildings shall be built with a finished, all weather exterior material. Detached garages and carports shall be finished to match the exterior of the main building.
4. Any building elevation facing a street or right of way shall include at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock.
Public Facilities Zone (P-F)

Exterior Building Materials:

1. Permitted exterior building materials for main buildings shall be brick, stucco, stone, rock, or vinyl siding.
2. Vinyl siding shall not be permitted on the front elevation of a main building.
3. Accessory buildings shall be built with a finished, all weather exterior material. Detached garages and carports shall be finished to match the exterior of the main building.
4. Any building elevation facing a street or right of way shall include at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock.

Manufacturing Zone (M-1)

Exterior Building Materials:

1. Permitted exterior building materials for main buildings shall be brick, stucco, stone, rock, or vinyl siding. Exposed tilt-up finished concrete and metal may also be used as a primary material on buildings located in the M-1 manufacturing zone, provided there is incorporation of and significant variation in materials along the base and near the entrances of the building.
2. Vinyl siding shall not be permitted on the front elevation of a main building.
3. Accessory buildings shall be built with a finished, all weather exterior material.
4. Any building elevation facing a street or right of way shall include at least two (2) of the following: brick, stucco, stone, or rock.

**BROADER BUILDING MATERIALS BY ZONE**

Commercial Residential (C-R), Downtown Redevelopment (D-R), Buffer Zone (B-1)

G. Design Standards: All new site development or construction in the C-R commercial residential zone shall incorporate the appropriate design standards described in chapter 18 of this title. (Ord. 2009-38, 11-24-2009)

G. Design Standards: All new site development or construction in the D-R downtown redevelopment zone shall incorporate the appropriate design standards described in chapter 18 of this title. (Ord. 2010-11, 6-22-2010)

G. Design Standards: All new site development or construction in the B-1 buffer zone shall incorporate the appropriate design standards described in chapter 18 of this title.
Mixed-Use Zone (MU)

All design elements of a project in the Mixed-Use Zone are based upon the approval of a Master Development Plan.

BUILDING DESIGN STANDARDS – CHAPTER 18

Chapter 18 “Design Standards” provides development standards that are applicable to all new development within Clearfield City. The building design standards section of that chapter have been provided for review below.

A. Context: All building designs shall consider surrounding or nearby buildings and developments and implement design solutions which are sensitive to those nearby buildings and developments. The review of this requirement shall be based on the following:

1. The buildings contribute positively to the overall character of the city and the neighborhood in which it is located;

2. The buildings reflect the character of surrounding development through the use of similar positive and desirable features;

3. The buildings demonstrate imaginative design; and

4. Where proposed building designs closely copy or mirror surrounding development, the buildings vary colors, materials, or architectural elements.

B. Entrances: All building entrances shall be clearly articulated to indicate a transition from the exterior to the interior of the building. Every main entrance shall have a special emphasis when compared to the other portions of the building. This shall be accomplished through the use of at least three (3) of the following near entrances:

1. A prominent architectural feature that is unique to the overall building design;

2. Complementary yet differing building materials or colors;

3. Increased use of windows or glass;

4. Pedestrian amenities that may include patios, porches, special paving treatments, seating areas, or awnings; or
5. Increased landscaping.

C. Facade Articulation: Buildings designed with completely flat facades and monotone color schemes shall not be permitted. All buildings shall demonstrate articulation of all facades.

1. Horizontal or vertical facade variations shall occur at least every thirty feet (30\') or along a minimum of sixty percent (60\%) of the horizontal length of buildings with facades one hundred feet (100\') or greater. This shall be accomplished by using methods such as:

   a. Variation in the surface plane that may include pop outs, bays, and recesses;
   
   b. Variation in the surface pattern such as arches, banding, and paneling; or
   
   c. Distinguished treatment of windows, doors, and eaves that may include molding or framing.

2. Buildings with facades one hundred feet (100\') or greater in total length shall have at least one significant facade variation from the primary wall plane whose depth is at least five percent (5\%) of the total facade length and whose width is at least twenty percent (20\%) of the total facade length. There shall be no uninterrupted facades one hundred feet (100\') or greater in length.

D. Height and Roofline: All buildings shall demonstrate an appropriate roof height that is compatible with the building's location, and vary rooflines in order to add architectural interest and avoid the appearance or sense of monotonous roofline expanses. All buildings shall:

1. Demonstrate appropriate roof height for the location based on zoning regulations and the height of buildings within the immediate area;

2. Provide roofline and parapet variations where there are long, continuous, and undisturbed rooflines fifty feet (50\') or greater;

3. Use similar materials and colors on the back of false fronts, parapets, cornices, or other parts of the building which extend beyond the roofline or main building so that the building appears cohesive from all views; and

4. Provide for screening of mechanical equipment and systems that need to be mounted on the roof. Any minimal portion of these pieces of equipment that may not be fully shielded shall be painted a color which is compatible with the roofing or parapet materials.
E. Massing: Buildings shall have a composition which clearly relates to surrounding buildings, as well as to the overall scale of the built environment in nearby residential or commercial neighborhoods. Proper massing reduces the impact of the massive bulk created by large buildings that may not otherwise relate in scale to surrounding development. Vertical articulation, horizontal articulation, and multi-planed roof and awning designs should be used to mitigate the impact that may occur on surrounding development and the overall landscape.

F. Materials: High quality, long lasting materials shall be required for all buildings in order to contribute to the aesthetics of the community over the long term. Permanence in design and construction will add to the overall value and sustainability of the community.

1. A minimum of three (3) colors per elevation shall be required.

2. Color utilization should be sensitive to existing development within the vicinity and the natural landscape in which the project is situated.

3. All projects shall submit a sample board containing actual samples of all exterior surface materials, including roofing materials, in all the colors that will be used. No photos shall be permitted.

G. Pedestrian Considerations: All buildings shall consider pedestrians as an integral part of the design. Additionally, buildings that contain more than one story or that are taller than twenty feet (20’) in height shall provide a clearly articulated and more detailed base that relates to pedestrians.

H. Windows: The majority of windows shall relate to the scale of the person.

1. Windows should be at eye level when possible and provide for transparency into the building.

2. Where buildings are adjacent to pedestrian walkways, transparent windows shall be used to relate the scale of the building and the building’s interior to pedestrians. Where transparent windows may not be desirable, tinted windows, false windows, or glass block shall be used.

3. Window awnings are an effective way to add detail and variation to a building, emphasize pedestrian scale windows, and create an exciting and inviting environment. When placing awnings:
a. Quality materials shall be used which are durable and are able to withstand extremes in the weather;

b. Colors should be complementary to the color of the building on which the awning is located; and

c. Styles should be compatible with the architectural features and overall architecture of the building on which the awning is located.

I. Architectural Details: Surface details, ornaments, and other building elements that enrich the character of a building shall be provided. Attention to detail, including all building and architectural design elements shall be required. The following architectural details are desirable and encouraged:

1. Stonework;

2. Exposed beams and columns;

3. Cornices, moldings, bands, pop outs, decorative vents, cast or sculpted features;

4. Covered walkways, breezeways, bays, and balconies;

5. Courtyards and patios;

6. Wide roof overhangs; and

7. Accessories such as art features, benches, pots, lamps, artwork, and sculptures.

J. Building Additions: All additions to existing buildings shall incorporate the predominant architectural features, materials, and colors of the existing building. (Ord. 2010-04, 1-26-2010)
**STAFF CONCLUSION / RECOMMENDATION**

Based upon a review of the materials that are allowed currently in the code and have been allowed with other developments throughout Clearfield City, staff concludes that these materials are not an extensive list of the only materials that can be used for new developments. Rather, these materials shall be used, but other materials may also be used.

Staff recommends the following:

1. This list of materials in the code not be the only approved materials.
2. The term vinyl siding be removed so at to allow a larger variety of siding.
3. Vinyl siding continue to be limited to the sides of buildings and not allowed for multi-family buildings.
4. Vinyl siding be prohibited for the commercial zones (C-1 & C-2).

**LIST OF ATTACHMENTS**

1. Siding Examples
FIBER CEMENT SIDING

Shapes

- Perfection Shingles
- Random Square Straight Edge
- Random Square Staggered Edge
- Half-Rounds
- Octagons
- Individual Shakes

Lap Siding

- Cedar Lap Siding
- Smooth Lap Siding
- Smooth Beaded Lap Siding
- Textured Beaded Lap Siding
- Textured Dutchlap Siding

Vertical Siding

- Cedar No Groove
- Cedar 8” Groove
- Smooth
- Stucco
VINYL SIDING
DESCRIPTION / BACKGROUND

In 2017 Clearfield City adopted amendments to development standards for accessory buildings. The major changes included the size and location of accessory structures based on property size. One standard that has remained consistent prior to the amendments is the requirement that accessory buildings and structures are required to match the materials of the main or principal building. In Section 38 of the Supplementary Regulations chapter, the standard reads as follows:

E. Accessory buildings and structures shall be built with a finished, all weather exterior material and shall be finished to match the exterior of the principal building. (Emphasis added)

This section of code also clarifies that accessory buildings or structures 120 square feet or less do not need to meet design standards; therefore, they are not required to match the principal building (i.e. small sheds would be exempt).

Additional Standards by Zone

In all of the single family zoning districts, “Detached garages and carports shall be finished to match the exterior of the main building.” In the multi-family and commercial zones (R-2, R-3, C-1, & C-2), “Accessory buildings shall be built with a finished, all weather exterior material. Detached garages and carports shall be finished to match the exterior of the main building.”

Based upon a need to provide clear guidance to residents and property owners in the City, staff is seeking clarification from the Planning Commission regarding these standards. Additionally, if additional language or standards are needed to provide a more clear direction for the community, the Planning Commission is encouraged to provide direction to staff about what types of changes are necessary to provide that clarity.

EXACT MATCH

The following examples are of detached garages or accessory structures in Clearfield City that match the house very closely if not identically. This provides the most uniform look, but can be costly and may be difficult for many residents to afford.
MATCH WITH COLOR

The following examples are of detached garages or accessory structures in Clearfield City that match the principal building with color, but not with material. There is a clear difference between the principal and accessory buildings and not as much uniformity in design. This can be more affordable to residents in Clearfield and may be appropriate based upon the desire to provide this type of use for properties in the City.
INCONSISTENCY WITH PRINCIPAL BUILDING

The following examples are of detached garages or accessory structures in Clearfield City that do not match the principal building in any way. Based upon adopted standards this is something that the City is trying to avoid and discourage throughout all areas of the City.
METAL GARAGES & CARPORTS

Many residents inquire about the use of metal carports or garages on their property as an accessory structure. Most residents that inquire of about the use of these buildings are willing to paint them to match the principal building. Staff is seeking Planning Commission feedback on whether these types of structures could be allowed in the City if they match the paint color of the principal building or if they should be allowed in any way.
STAFF FINDINGS & RECOMMENDATION

Staff has identified that the majority of accessory structures in Clearfield are built with permanent materials and appear to include foundations. The majority of detached garages and large accessory buildings are located on properties with smaller homes that were not built with an attached garage and match the exact materials that are used on the principal building. Accessory structures that are not constructed of the exact same materials but are painted in matching color are less common, and appear more on agriculturally zoned properties that do not include these design standards. The same goes for metal garages and carports being found mostly on agriculturally zoned properties.

Based upon this analysis, Staff recommends that clarity be provided regarding the term “match” and whether it should be an exact match, or match in color design.